



MUNICIPAL AND PLANNING LAW
Casebook

STANLEY M. MAKUCH

PART I

1995-1996

With the assistance of

Victoria Cowling and Peter Oelbaum

**FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO**

40. 1/2.

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY

SEP 6 1995

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

MUNICIPAL AND PLANNING LAW

Casebook

STANLEY M. MAKUCH

PART I

1995-1996

With the assistance of

Victoria Cowling and Peter Oelbaum

**FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO**



Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

MUNICIPAL AND PLANNING LAW
Table of Contents
PART I

Chapter 1

Introduction	1
Robarts, Report of the Royal Commission on Metropolitan Toronto	2
Plunkett, The Financial Structure and the Decision-Making Process of Canadian Municipal Government	7

Chapter 2

The Organization of Municipalities

Introduction	13
Council	14
The Mayor	16
The Executive	18
Standing Committees	19
Reform of the Organization of Municipalities	
Approaches to Reform	21
The Reorganization of Municipalities	23
Metropolitan Government - Toronto	24
Advisory Committee on Intergovernmental Relations, Alternative Approaches Governmental Reorganization in Metropolitan Areas	32
Saville, An Overview of the Proposals for a New Municipal Government Act for Alberta, (5 C.J.A.L.P. 94)	37
Problems with Reorganization	
Robarts, Report of the Royal Commission on Metropolitan Toronto, vol. 2 (June, 1977) .	44
Bureau of Municipal Research, "The 101 Governments of Metro Toronto" Civic Affairs, October 1968	45
Simpson, "City loses important votes at first meeting of Metro Council"	54
Globe & Mail, "City decides on legal fight over Spadina"	55
Globe & Mail, "York joins city in opposing Spadina paving"	56

Chapter 3

Local Government Financing

Introduction	57
Political and Legal Limitations	
Limited Financial Base	59
Restrictions on Borrowing	62
Eddy, The Referendum Requirement:	
A Constitutional Limitation on Local Government Debt in Florida	
(38 U Miami L.R. 677)	67
Property Assessment and Taxation	
Who is liable for property tax?	70
What is assessable or taxable property?	71
Exemptions from Taxation	76
Crown Lands	77
<i>Re Delta Parking Systems Ltd. and Township of Toronto</i> 1965 1 O.R. 380 (H.C.)	79
Indian Lands	83
Places of Worship	84
<i>Re Presbyterian Church Building Corp. and Assessment Comm.</i>	
for Algoma 1973 3 O.R. 1007 (Dist. Ct.)	85
<i>Re Singh and City of Sudbury</i> 1976 8 O.R. (2d) 377 (Dist. Ct.)	88
Public Education Institutions	94
<i>Seafarers Training Institute v. Township of Williamsburg</i> (1982),	
19 M.P.L.R. 183 (Ont. H.C.)	96
<i>Associated Gospel Churches v. Regional Assessment Commissioner,</i>	
<i>et al.</i> 1980, 9 M.P.L.R. 8	100
<i>Camp Grounds Association of Canada</i>	
- <i>Great Lakes Conference of Free Methodist Church v. Corporation</i>	
<i>of The Township of Zorra et al.</i> (1988), 38 M.P.L.R. 1	104
<i>Western Day Care Centre v. Corp. of The City of London</i> (1982) 16 M.P.L.R. 35	105
Other Organizations	106
<i>Re York Central Hospital Association and Township of Vaughan</i> (1972)	
1 O.R. 244	108
Charitable Institutions	109
<i>Regional Assessment Commissioner, Region No. 23 v. LDARC</i>	
(1985) 29 M.P.L.R. 9	111

Municipal Properties	114
<i>Toronto Transit Commission v. City of Toronto</i> (1971) 18 D.L.R. 3d 68	115
Pollution Control	116
Exemptions and Ownership of Property	117
<i>Re Kiwanis Club of Brantford and Township of Brantford</i> (1983) 24	
M.P.L.R. 161	119
Exceptions to Exemptions and Municipal Exemptions	121
Bonuses	123
Laux, Municipal Bonuses and Tax Exemptions to Entice Private	
Developments 2 Alta. L.R. 1987 at 234.	124
The Valuation of Property for Assessment Purposes	
Market Value	138
<i>Assessment Commissioner of the York Assessment Office v. Office Specialty</i>	
<i>Ltd.</i> [1975] 1 S.C.R. 677.	141
Equity	143
<i>Re Devald and Regional Assessment Commissioner, Region No.16</i> (1977) 15 O.R.	
(2d) 212	146
<i>Regional Assessment Commissioners Region No.2 v. Ontario Steel</i>	
<i>Products Co. Ltd.</i> (1975) 61 D.L.R. (3d) 468 (S.C.C.)	148
Business Assessment	151
<i>Re Mowat and Lorne Murphy Foods Ltd.</i> (1972) 1 O.R. 559	153
Meaning of "Carrying on Business"	155
<i>Kitchener-Waterloo Real Estate Board Inc. v. Regional Assessment Commissioner,</i>	
Region No. 21 (1986) 32 M.P.L.R. 1.	158
<i>Canadian Life Insurance Association Inc. v. Regional Assessment Commissioner</i>	
Region No. 9 (1983) 22 M.P.L.R. 113	166
Determining Who Is Carrying on The Business	171
<i>Re Seagrams Distillers (Ontario) Ltd. and Regional Assessment Commissioner, Regions</i>	
Nos. 9 and 10 (1986) 54 O.R. (2d) 289.	173
<i>Aluminum Company of Canada Ltd. v. Regional Assessment Commissioner,</i>	
Region No. 5 (1984) 26 M.P.L.R. 1.	176
Appeals	177
<i>Downtown Churchworkers Association of the Anglican Church of Canada and Diocese</i>	
<i>of Toronto v. Regional Assessment Commissioner, Region No. 07</i> (1978) 5	
M.P.L.R.261 (Div. Ct.)	178

Chapter 4

Judicial Review of Municipal Action

Introduction	184
Constitutionality	
Distribution of powers	185
The Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms	188
Express Authority	
Makuch, "The Validity of Municipal By-laws"	192
<i>Superior Propane Inc. and Propane Gas Association v. Corporation of the City of York</i> (1991) 6 O.R. (3d) (Div. Ct.)	212
<i>Stadium Corp. of Ontario Ltd. v. Corporation of the City of Toronto; Attorney General</i> <i>for Ontario, Intervenor</i> (April 1, 1993), Toronto C13313 (Ont. C.A.)	220
<i>R. v. Greenbaum</i> (February 25, 1993), S.C.C., No.22332	225
<i>R. v. Sharma</i> (February 25, 1993), S.C.C., No. 22506	233
<i>Re Christie Taxi Ltd. and Doran</i> (1975) 10 O.R. (2d) 313	239
<i>The Ottawa Electric Light Company v. The Corporation of The City of Ottawa</i> 1906 12 O.R. 290	244
Discrimination	
Young, Discrimination in the Exercise of Delegated Municipal Power (49 The Advocate 1991) at 752	245
Delegation	
To employees	250
To council committees	251
The community	254
Fettering	256
Case Note: 1984 Revisited - Regulating by Unfettered Discretion: <i>Foley v. Padley</i>	257
The Impact of Provincial Policy	262
Vagueness	265
Unreasonableness	269
Geographic Limitations	271
Technical Requirements	272
Bad Faith	275